

PAKISTAN JOURNAL OF HEALTH SCIENCES

https://thejas.com.pk/index.php/pjhs Volume 4, Issue 9 (September 2023)



Original Article

Parents' Spirituality, Parenting Practices and Disruptive Behaviour Disorders among Pakistani Children

Sameena Igbal^{*} and Mamoona Ismail Loona¹

¹Department of Psychology, International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan

ARTICLE INFO

Key Words:

Parents' Spirituality, Parenting Practices, Disruptive Behaviour Disorders

How to Cite:

Iqbal, S., & Loona, M. I. (2023). Parents' Spirituality, Parenting Practices and Disruptive Behaviour Disorders among Pakistani Children: Parents' Spirituality and Parenting Practices and DBD among Children. Pakistan Journal of Health Sciences, 4(09). https://doi.org/10.54393/pjhs.v4i09.1004

*Corresponding Author:

Sameenalqbal
Department of Psychology, International Islamic
University, Islamabad, Pakistan
sameena.iqbal1@gmail.com

Received Date: 23rd August, 2023 Acceptance Date: 12th September, 2023 Published Date: 30th September, 2023

ABSTRACT

This study looked at the relationship between parent's spirituality, parenting practices and the growth of Disruptive Behavior Disorder (DBD) in Children. Objectives: To assess the relationship between Parents' Spirituality, Parenting Practices and Disruptive Behavior Disorder. To find out gender differences on parents 'spirituality scale and DBD rating Scale. Methods: 500 Pakistani children aged 7 to 11 who were subjected to standardized screening procedures for disruptive behaviour disorders made up the sample. The sample was collected from Islamabad and $Raw alpin dipublic \ and \ private \ schools. \ Using \ the \ Spirituality \ Scale, the \ spirituality \ of \ the \ parents$ was assessed. Parenting styles based on self-report and disruptive behaviours based on parent/teacher reports were the outcome variables. Results: The study's results revealed a noteworthy positive association between DBD and parenting practices while a significant negative association was found between parents' spirituality and their parenting practices which indicates that parents who exhibit a heightened level of spirituality are less likely to use ineffective parenting practices resulting in better management of disruptive behavior problems among their children. Children in private schools have less behavioral issues than those in public schools. Additional research shows that boys are more likely than girls to have DBD. Conclusions: Disruptive behavior disorders are linked to the spirituality of the parents as well as the parenting styles they use to discipline their kids. The study's targeted constructs may help in the early detection, prevention, and management of disruptive behavior disorders.

INTRODUCTION

Children acquire behaviour from their social surroundings at a young age by witnessing role models in similar situations [1]. The family is a social structure that significantly affects children's social interactions inside the family as well as their overall development. Additionally, parenting is an ecological component that significantly affects the way a child's personality develops [2]. Behavioural issues in children are frequently thought to be related to parenting styles [3, 4]. Parenting styles vary in their characteristics and can have an obvious effect on how children behave [5, 6]. Since parenting style either exacerbates or ameliorates behavioural issues in children. Maternal and paternal parenting styles, according to some

prior studies, are essential to comprehending the growth of externalizing and internalizing tendencies [7]. According to Sulik et al., the impacts of parenting behaviours on children's development tend to be constant over time [8]. Parents choose from a variety of discipline techniques to control their child's behaviour based on the parenting style they use, and these techniques are thought to be an essential part of parenting [9]. Studies examining the relationship between parenting and children's behaviour are based on theories including attachment theory, transactional theory, ecological theory and social learning theory. The prevailing idea in these theories is that parents influence children's behaviours either directly or indirectly.

First, it is emphasized that youngsters have an innate propensity to seek proximity from cares in difficult situations in Bowlby's theory of attachment. Children's development is influenced by how parents react to certain behaviours, such as by demonstrating warmth, rejection, or overprotection [10]. Second, according to Bronfenbrenner's ecological theory, parents and other primary cares have a significant impact on children [11]. Thirdly, according to transactional theory children's developmental outcomes are a direct product of their own reciprocal interactions with the experiences their families and social environments provide [12]. Due to the fact that children's behaviours are influenced by a combination of their present behaviours and the family's reactions to those behaviours, transactional theory places equal focus on the child and the surrounding family setting. Last but not least, Bandura's social learning theory depicts a learning system in which people collaborate and gain knowledge from one another. This theory holds that social environments are where we acquire new behaviours through processes including imitation, modelling, and observation. These theories suggest that children's behaviours are influenced by the environment they live in. Children's interactions with their parents and how parents respond to them establish the groundwork for the development of children's behaviour because parents are the earliest and most personal persons in children's lives [13]. Additionally, according to some researchers, parents' spiritual maturity has a good impact on their children's growth [14]. Parenting can have a positive impact on their children's mental health. According to several early studies religious conviction has a significant influence in influencing the adoption of parenting practices [15]. By putting a focus on family ties and parents' commitment to actively participate in their children's lives, religious beliefs can influence values and behavior. Religious convictions can influence how families interact by allowing or forbidding the use of certain substances. This needs to be incorporated into parenting practices because it can provide value, offer encouragement, and motivate purpose and meaning [16]. According to preliminary research, parental spiritual practices may have an impact on children's and teenagers' risk of becoming delinquent Furthermore parents who were more religiously active were more likely to have successful marriages and capable parenting skills. The consequence has been an improvement in children's competence, self-control, psychosocial adjustment, and academic accomplishment [17]. An association between greater rates of parents' church attendance and children's internalizing and externalizing symptomatology was found in various studies that show that parents have a significant impact on their children's views and behaviours, especially their religiosity. Parents' spiritual maturity generally has a good impact on their children's growth [18]. This study attempts to close the knowledge gap between spirituality and parenting, which can influence how parents approach behavioural issues with their kids. This study sheds light on the topic of spiritual belief and how it affects parenting styles and behavioural issues in kids. This study advances knowledge in the fields of parenting, spirituality, and child behaviour issues. Additionally, stakeholders can utilize this study to inform decisions and policies about spirituality and parenting for parents, clinicians, and policy makers.

METHODS

A descriptive cross sectional design was used to conduct this study. The data were collected from different private and public sector schools of Islamabad during Jan., 2022 to June, 2022 after getting approval from ethical committee. A sample of 500 students was calculated by using social science calculator. Convenient sampling technique was used for collecting data. Children having age of 7-11 years with high score on disruptive behavior rating scale were included in the study. Children with any kind of organic pathology or those who scored low on DBD were excluded from the study. The primary objectives of this study encompass a multifaceted investigation centered on the interplay between parents' spirituality, parenting practices, and DBD in children. Firstly, this research aims to comprehensively assess the impact of parents' spirituality and their parenting practices on the occurrence and severity of Disruptive Behavior Disorder in children. By delving into these connections, we aim to gain valuable insights into how spiritual beliefs and parenting approaches may influence or mitigate the development of DBD in children. Secondly, this study seeks to explore potential gender differences in both parents' spirituality and DBD rating scales. By examining these variations, we aim to shed light on whether gender plays a role in shaping parental spirituality and the assessment of Disruptive Behavior Disorder. This aspect of the research will contribute to a deeper understanding of how gender dynamics may intersect with spiritual beliefs and behavioral assessments within the context of parenting. In summary, the study hypothesizes several key relationships: Firstly, it posits that there exists a significant relationship between parents' spirituality and the prevalence of Disruptive Behavior Disorders in children. Secondly, it anticipates a positive correlation between parents' spirituality and the quality of their parenting practices. Finally, the study anticipates a direct relationship between the effectiveness of parenting practices and the manifestation of Disruptive Behavior Disorder among children. To facilitate the acquisition of essential information from both instructors and students,

school administrators were initially contacted. Subsequently, a concerted effort was made to engage parents through their respective schools for the purpose of data collection. The process commenced with the organization of introductory sessions during Parent-Teacher Meetings, during which presentations were delivered to underscore the significance of the study. It was within these sessions that valuable data were gathered from parents, employing specialized parenting and spirituality assessment scales. The Parenting scale [19], comprising a total of 30 items, employed a scoring system on a 1 to 7 scale used for assessing parents' parenting practices. In this scale, a score of 7 was indicative of the least effective response for each item, allowing for a nuanced evaluation of parenting practices. Concurrently, the spirituality of the participating parents was evaluated using a 30-item Spirituality scale [20], which incorporated a Likert-type format. This format provided respondents with the flexibility to express their level of agreement or disagreement, ranging from strongly disagree to strongly agree, thereby offering insights into their individual spiritual inclinations. In assessing the presence of Disruptive Behavior Disorder (DBD) among children, the DBD rating scale [21] was employed. This comprehensive scale consisted of 42 items, each subject to rating on a four-point Likert scale. The rating scale allowed respondents to gauge the degree of manifestation of DBD in children, with responses ranging from 0 (not at all) to 3 (very much). To analyze the data and draw meaningful conclusions, statistical tool SPSS was used. The Pearson Correlation was utilized to uncover relationships between the various study variables, providing valuable insights into potential connections. Furthermore, to discern gender differences and variations between private and public sector schools concerning the presence of DBD, the t-test was effectively employed. This rigorous and systematic approach to data collection and analysis ensures the robustness and reliability of the study's findings.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the frequencies and percentage of children with respect to age, gender, age, gender, birth order, grade, parents' education, their profession, and monthly income, no. of siblings, family system, duration of DBD, difficulty managing DBD, child physical and psychological illness, mother physical and psychological illness, father physical and psychological illness, any other family member having psychological illness and his relationship with the child. Two groups i.e. private (f=250, 50%) and public schools (f=250, 50%) were equal in number. Two age groups 7-8 years (f=166, 33%) and 9-10 years (f=166, 33%) were equal in number while 11 years age group (f=168, 34%) showed a minor difference in ratio. Girls (f=251, 51%) were greater in

number than boys (f=249, 49%). Groups on the basis of grades express that children studying in grade 3-4 (f=168, 34%) and 5-6 (f=168, 34%) were grater in number than children studying in grade 1-2 (f=164, 32%). Groups including birth order showed difference with middle born (f=188, 38%) greater than those first born (f=156, 31%), last born (f=98, 20%) and only child (f=58, 11%). Groups regarding mother's age showed that 31-35 years of age group (f=259. 52%) were larger in number as compared to the groups of 21-30 years (f=73, 15%) and 36-40 years (f=168, 15%)34%). Two groups related to mother's profession showed that working mothers (f=289, 58%) were greater contrary to house manager mothers. Further, mother's education groups i.e., Intermediate (f=83,37%), Graduate (f=187,46%), and Post - Graduate (f=230, 58%) showed high percentage of post-graduate mothers in the selected sample of the study. Similarly, groups consisting of father's age showed difference in ratio with 36-40 years (f=172, 34%) higher in number than 25-30 years (f=17, 3%) and 31-35 years (f=119, 24%). Three groups covering father's education expressed discrepancy in occurrence of cases in Intermediate (f=4, 1%), Graduate (f=208, 41%) and Post-Graduate (f=230, 58%) levels of education, indicating high percentage of post graduated fathers. With regard to father's professions, it is cleared from the table that most of the fathers were serving in the government sector (f=269, 54%) as compared to private sector (f=106, 21%) and fathers running their own business (f=125, 25%). On the bases of monthly income those with above 2 lac (f=208, 42%) income were greater in number than those with 50, 0000 to 1 lakh (f=84, 17%) and above one lakh to 1,50,0000 thousands (f=170, 34%). Family system ratio also varied with nuclear family system having higher ratio (f=429, 84%) than joint family system (f=71, 16%). 53% of the children were having disruptive behavior issues more than 6 months while only 45% parents were facing difficulty in handling these behavioral issues displaying by their children.

Table 1: Frequencies and percentages of demographic variables of Study(N=500)

Variables	Category	f(%)
	7-8	166 (33)
Child Age	9-10	166 (33)
	11	168 (34)
Child Gender	Boy	249 (49)
	Girl	251 (51)
	First Born	156 (31)
Birth Order	Middle Born	188 (38)
	Last Born	98 (20)
	Only Child	58 (11)
	1-2	164 (32)
Grade	3-4	168 (34)
	5-6	168 (34)

DOI: https://doi.org/10.54393/pjhs.v4i09.1004

	Public	250 (50)		
School	Private	250 (50)		
	21-30	73 (15)		
Mother Age	31-35	259 (52)		
•	36-40	168 (34)		
	Intermediate	83 (17)		
Mother Education	Graduate	187 (37)		
	Post Graduate	230 (46)		
	Working	289 (58)		
Mothers Profession	House Managers	211(42)		
	25-30	17(3)		
	31-35	119 (24)		
Father Age	36-40	172 (34)		
	41-45	192 (38)		
	Intermediate	4(1)		
Father Education	Graduate	208 (41)		
rather Eudoation	Post Graduate	289 (58)		
	Govt. Service			
Father Profession	Private Sector	269 (54) 106 (21)		
Father Profession				
	Own Business	125 (25)		
	50,000 - 10,0000	84 (17)		
Monthly Income	11,0000 -1,50,000	170 (34)		
•	1,51,000 - 2,00000	38(8)		
	Above 2,00000	208 (42)		
Family System	Nuclear	429 (84)		
. , ,	Joint	71 (16)		
	1-3	420 (84)		
No. of Children	4-6	77 (15)		
	7 & More	3 (0.6)		
Duration of DBD	1-5 Months	148 (29)		
buration of BBB	6-12 Months	266 (53)		
Managing DBD	No	277 (55)		
Trainaging DDD	Yes	223 (45)		
Child Physical Illness	No	496 (99)		
Ciliid Filysical lilliess	Yes	3 (1)		
Child Psychological Illness	No	498 (99)		
Ciliu Esychological lilliess	Yes	2(1)		
Mather Dhysical Illness	No	441 (88)		
Mother Physical Illness	Yes	59 (12)		
M D . L	No	497 (99)		
Mother Psychological Illness	Yes	3(1)		
E.I. DI : I'''	No	478 (96)		
Father Physical Illness	Yes	22(4)		
5	No	493 (99)		
Father Psychological Illness	Yes	7(1)		
	No	495 (99)		
Family Psychological Illness	Yes	5(1)		
	Grand Mother	1(0.2)		
	Uncle	1(0.2)		
Relationship with Child	Aunt	1(0.2)		
	Cousin	2(0.4)		

Table 2 expresses the correlation between DBD, Parenting Scale and Spirituality Scale. It is clear from the table that

DBD was positively correlated with PS (r = .75, p < .01) and negatively correlated with SS (r = -.84, p < .01). PS demonstrated negative correlations with SS (r = -.69, p < .01).

Table 2: Pearson Correlation among study variables (N=500)

Variables	1	2	3
1.DBD	-	.75**	84**
2.PS	-	-	69**
3.SS	-	-	-

Note. ***p < .001, **p < .01, *p < .05 DBD=Disruptive Behavior Disorder, PS=Parenting Scale, SS=Spirituality Scale Table 3 shows differences of gender in regard to disruptive behavior disorder. Boys had a higher mean score in DBD (M = 106.13, SD = 17.78) compared to girls (M = 100.46, SD = 21.85), t(498)=3.17, p<.001, Cohen's d=0.28.

Table 3: Mean, Standard Deviations and t-values for Disruptive Behavior Disorder among boys and girls (N=500)

Variables	Boys (n=249)		(40) (000)		р	95%	6 CI	Cohen's d	
	М	SD	М	SD			LL	UL	
DBD	106.13	17.78	100.46	21.85	3.17	.00	2.16	9.16	0.28

Note. CI = Confidence Interval; LL = Lower Limit; UL = Upper Limit Students in public schools had a higher mean score for DBD (M = 105.85, SD = 18.67) compared to their counterparts in private schools (M = 100.72, SD = 21.18). The t-test yielded a value of t (498) = 2.87, with a p-value of .004, indicating statistical significance. The 95% confidence interval for the difference in means ranged from 1.61 to 8.63. The effect size, as measured by Cohen's d, was 0.25, indicating a small to moderate effect. These findings suggest that the type of school (public or private) is associated with differences in DBD scores among students. Table 4 shows details.

Table 4: Mean, Standard Deviation and t-values for DBD among Public and Private Schools (N=500)

Variables	Public (n=250)	Private (n=250)	t	р	95%	% CI	Cohen's d
	M (SD)	M (SD)			LL	UL	
DBD	105.85(18.67)	100.72(21.18)	2.87	.004	1.61	8.63	0.25

Note. DBD=Disruptive Behavior Disorder

DISCUSSION

The present research was commenced for the exploration of prevalence of disruptive behavior disorder among Pakistani children and its relationship with other psychological phenomenon that may help to devise prevention and treatment strategies. A sample of (N=500) children consisted of boys (n=249) and girls (251), 7 to 11year-olds were selected from both public and private schools. A total number of 3 scales were used to measure DBD and its relevant factors like parenting, and parents' spirituality. DBD was used to measure Disruptive Behavior Disorder, Parenting Scale was used to measure the

DOI: https://doi.org/10.54393/pjhs.v4i09.1004

parenting practices used by the parents. Further for the assessment of spirituality among parents Spirituality Scale was used. The results of the study indicate high presence of DBDs among public school children as compared to the private schools. Additionally a significant difference among boys and girls in disruptive behavior disorder was observed; boys manifest more behavioral problems than girls. These results are in-line with the studies conducted in different parts of the world like a study conducted in Iran (2020) highlighted that prevalence of disruptive behavior was 7.6% in boys and 3.1% in girls with the mean score of 22.97 and 19.15 for boys and girls respectively [22]. Similarly a study conducted in Pakistan also indicated high prevalence rate of DBD in Boys (7.6%) than the girls (3.8%) [23]. Results of the study also highlighted the relationship between DBD and Parenting practices. It is clear from the findings that DBD is positively and significantly related to parenting practices. Further as the parents' spirituality decreases, it increases child behavioral problems. The study's findings are consistent with those of earlier investigations, such as one that discovered a link between social anxiety, timidity, behavioural issues, and parental overprotection and control [24]. According to Harvey et al., families with liberal parenting practices were more likely to have children who had internalizing and externalizing behaviour difficulties [25]. The studies' findings about the protective benefits of parents' spirituality revealed that their spirituality played diverse roles in the development of internalizing and externalizing symptomatology. Particularly, when the parent-child relationship is better, parents' spirituality seems to have a greater impact on the outcomes of children's adjustment. According to other study children whose parents said their faith was important to them shown lower levels of externalizing and internalizing symptomatology, while those whose parents said they regularly attended church displayed lower levels of internalizing symptomatology [18]. The same studies carried out in Pakistan found that permissive and authoritarian parenting styles are important determinants in the development of aggressive behaviour, while religious commitment and authoritative parenting styles have a negative impact on antisocial aggressive behavior [26].

CONCLUSIONS

Disruptive behaviour disorder is associated with parents' spirituality as well as parenting practices imply by the parents to discipline their children. Targeted constructs of the study may assist in prevention, early identification and intervention for the management of disruptive behavior disorders.

Authors Contribution

Conceptualization: SI

Methodology: SI, MIL Formal analysis: SI, MIL

Writing-review and editing: MIL

All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Conflicts of Interest The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Source of Funding

The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship and/or publication of this article.

REFERENCES

- Zilanawala A, Sacker A, Kelly Y. Internalizing and externalizing behaviour profiles across childhood: The consequences of changes in the family environment. Social Science & Medicine. 2019 Apr; 226: 207-16. doi: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2019.02.048.
- [2] Hosokawa R and Katsura T. Role of parenting style in children's behavioral problems through the transition from preschool to elementary school according to gender in Japan. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2019 Jan; 16(1): 21. doi: 10.3390/ijerph16010021.
- [3] Madhlopa Y, Qin J, Chen C. The relationships between child maltreatment and child behavior problems. Comparative study of Malawi and China. Children and Youth Services Review, 2020 Dec; 119: 105533, doi: 10.1016/j.childyouth.2020.105533.
- Özgür H. The relationship between Internet parenting styles and Internet usage of children and adolescents. Computers in Human Behavior. 2016 Jul; 60: 411-24. doi: 10.1016/j.chb.2016.02.081.
- Dempster R, Wildman B, Keating A. The role of stigma in parental help-seeking for child behavior problems. Journal of Clinical Child & Adolescent Psychology. 2013 Jan; 42(1): 56-67. doi: 10.1080/15374416.2012. 700504.
- [6] Fujiwara T, Kato N, Sanders MR. Effectiveness of Group Positive Parenting Program (Triple P) in changing child behavior, parenting style, and parental adjustment: An intervention study in Japan. Journal of Child and Family Studies. 2011 Dec; 20: 804-13. doi: 10.1007/s10826-011-9448-1.
- [7] Rinaldi CM and Howe N. Mothers' and fathers' parenting styles and associations with toddlers' externalizing, internalizing, and adaptive behaviors. Early Childhood Research Quarterly. 2012 Apr; 27(2): 266-73. doi: 10.1016/j.ecresq.2011.08.001.
- Sulik MJ, Blair C, Mills-Koonce R, Berry D, Greenberg M, Family Life Project Investigators, et al. Early parenting and the development of externalizing behavior problems: Longitudinal mediation through

- children's executive function. Child Development. 2015 Sep; 86(5): 1588-603. doi: 10.1111/cdev.12386.
- [9] van Dijk R, Deković M, Bunte TL, Schoemaker K, Zondervan-Zwijnenburg M, Espy KA, et al. Motherchild interactions and externalizing behavior problems in preschoolers over time: Inhibitory control as a mediator. Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology. 2017 Nov; 45: 1503-17. doi: 10.1007/s10802-016-0258-1.
- [10] Weingold R. Family dynamics: A systematic investigation of parenting styles, parent and peer attachment, locus of control, and social behaviors. Seton Hall University; 2011.
- [11] Swick KJ and Williams RD. An analysis of Bronfenbrenner's bio-ecological perspective for early childhood educators: Implications for working with families experiencing stress. Early Childhood Education Journal. 2006 Apr; 33: 371-8. doi: 10.1007/s10643-006-0078-y.
- [12] Elgendy SH. A transactional model of Parenting Practices and Children's Aggressive behavior in Neighborhood Context. Fordham University; 2010.
- [13] Durmusoglu Saltali N and İmir HM. Parenting Styles as a Predictor of the Preschool Children's Social Behaviours. Participatory Educational Research. 2018 Dec; 5(2): 18-37. doi: 10.17275/per.18.10.5.2.
- [14] Petro MR, Rich EG, Erasmus C, Roman NV. The effect of religion on parenting in order to guide parents in the way they parent: A systematic review. Journal of Spirituality in Mental Health. 2018 Apr; 20(2): 114-39. doi: 10.1080/19349637.2017.1341823.
- [15] Williams PD, Hunter WM, Seyer E, Sammut S, Breuninger MM. Religious/spiritual struggles and perceived parenting style in a religious college-aged sample. Mental Health, Religion & Culture. 2019 May; 22(5): 500-16. doi: 10.1080/13674676.2019.1629402.
- [16] Krok D. Examining the role of religion in a family setting: religious attitudes and quality of life among parents and their adolescent children. Journal of Family Studies. 2018 Sep; 24(3): 203-18. doi: 10.1080/13229400.2016.1176589.
- [17] Li H, Subrahmanyam K, Bai X, Xie X, Liu T. Viewing fantastical events versus touching fantastical events: Short-term effects on children's inhibitory control. Child Development. 2018 Jan; 89(1): 48-57. doi:10.1111/cdev.12820.
- [18] Kim J, McCullough ME, Cicchetti D. Parents' and children's religiosity and child behavioral adjustment among maltreated and non-maltreated children. Journal of Child and Family Studies. 2009 Oct; 18: 594-605. doi: 10.1007/s10826-009-9262-1.
- [19] Arnold DS, O'leary SG, Wolff LS, Acker MM. The

- Parenting Scale: a measure of dysfunctional parenting in discipline situations. Psychological Assessment. 1993 Jun; 5(2): 137. doi: 10.1037/1040-3590.5.2.137.
- [20] Delaney C. The spirituality scale: Development and psychometric testing of a holistic instrument to assess the human spiritual dimension. Journal of Holistic Nursing. 2005 Jun; 23(2): 145-67. doi: 10.1177/0898010105276180.
- [21] Loona MI and Kamal A. Translation and adaptation of disruptive behaviour disorder rating scale. Pakistan Journal of Psychological Research. 2011 Dec; 26(2): 149-65. doi: 10.1037/t42647-000.
- [22] Araban M, Montazeri A, Stein LA, Karimy M, Mehrizi AA. Prevalence and factors associated with disruptive behavior among Iranian students during 2015: A cross-sectional study. Italian Journal of Pediatrics. 2020 Dec; 46(1): 1-7. doi: 10.1186/s13052-020-00848-x.
- [23] Mushtaq A, Sabih F, Tariq PN. Prevalence of Oppositions Defiant Disorder (Odd) in School Children. Journal of Pakistan Psychiatric Society. 2015 Apr; 12(2): 22-5.
- [24] Dong Z, Zhou S, Case AS, Zhou W. The Relationship between Perceived Parenting Style and Social Anxiety: A Meta-analysis of Mainland Chinese Students. Child Psychiatry & Human Development. 2022 Jul: 1-5. doi: 10.1007/s10578-022-01399-4.
- [25] Harvey E, Stoessel B, Herbert S. Psychopathology and parenting practices of parents of preschool children with behavior problems. Parenting. 2011 Oct; 11(4): 239-63. doi: 10.1080/15295192.2011.613722.
- [26] Ashraf MU, Fatiana YA, Khan SW, Asif M, Ashraf A. Aggressive Behavior: Revisiting the Influence of Parenting Styles and Religious Commitment among Youth (A Study of South Punjab Pakistan). Psychology and Education. 2020 Nov; 57(9): 7056-67. doi: 10.17762/pae.v57i9.4386.